

Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī [2641] – Now We Judge You by Your
Public Deeds...



Commentaries by **Dārussalām**, Shaykh Muḥammad
bin Ṣāliḥ al-‘Uthaymīn [d. 1421H], and Ḥāfiẓ
Ṣalāḥuddīn Yūsuf [d. 1441H]

مكتبة تخريج الحديث

للنشر والرواية وتوزيع



Maktabah Takhrīj al-Ḥadīth
Publishing & Distribution

❁ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī [2641] – Now We Judge You by Your Public Deeds... ❁

Book 52: Witnesses Chapter 5: The just witnesses

حَدَّثَنَا الْحَكَمُ بْنُ نَافِعٍ، أَخْبَرَنَا شُعَيْبٌ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي حُمَيْدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، أَنَّ عَبْدَ اللَّهِ بْنَ عَبَّهَ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ يَقُولُ: «إِنَّ أَنَا كَأَنَّا يُؤْخَذُونَ بِالْوَحْيِ فِي عَهْدِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، وَإِنَّ الْوَحْيَ قَدْ انْقَطَعَ، وَإِنَّمَا نَأْخُذُكُمُ الْآنَ بِمَا ظَهَرَ لَنَا مِنْ أَعْمَالِكُمْ، فَمَنْ أَظْهَرَ لَنَا خَيْرًا، أَمَنَّا، وَقَرَّبَنَا، وَلَيْسَ إِلَيْنَا مِنْ سِرِّيَّتِهِ شَيْءٌ إِلَّا اللَّهُ يُجَاسِبُهُ فِي سِرِّيَّتِهِ، وَمَنْ أَظْهَرَ لَنَا سُوءًا لَمْ نَأْمَنَّهُ، وَلَمْ نُصَدِّقْهُ، وَإِنْ قَالَ: إِنَّ سِرِّيَّتَهُ حَسَنَةٌ»

It is narrated on the authority of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ that he said: “People were (sometimes) judged by the revealing of a Divine Inspiration during the lifetime of Allāh’s Messenger صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ but now there is no longer any more (new revelation). Now we judge you by the deeds you practice publicly, so we will trust and favor the one who does good deeds in front of us, and we will not call him to account about what he is really doing in secret, for Allāh will judge him for that; but we will not trust or believe the one who presents to us with an evil deed even if he claims that his intentions were good.”

→ **Commentary by Dārussalām (Bulūgh al-Marām):**

This ḥadīth states that the judgements shall be pronounced according to what seems to be justified and appropriate (apparently). In case someone commits perjury and makes a statement contrary to what the facts are, the sin thus incurred shall be solely credited to the perjurer. The court judge is hereby absolved of any sin whatsoever and bears no accountability in this matter. (1)

→ **Commentary by Shaykh Muḥammad bin Ṣāliḥ al-‘Uthaymīn رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ:**

The author رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ narrated this from the Leader of the Faithful, ‘Umar bin al-Khaṭṭāb رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, via ‘Abdullāh bin ‘Utbah bin Mas’ūd رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, the nephew of ‘Abdullāh bin Mas’ūd رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ, the noble companion of the Messenger of Allāh

(1) [1205 (1/497), Bulūgh al-Marām, Dārussalām (Eng)]

صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. ‘Umar stated that they would know about whoever conceals any evil secret during the period of Revelation through whatever was revealed. This was because there were hypocrites among the populace during the time of the Messenger of Allāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ; those who would display good but conceal evil. But Allāh – the Mighty and Sublime – used to expose them by way of revelation to His Messenger صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. He would uncover them by laying bare their characteristics, which are their specifics, not their names.

The wisdom behind this method is to serve as a general warning for each person who possesses similar traits. Allāh – the Mighty and Sublime – has said: **“And of them are some who made a covenant with Allāh (saying): ‘If He bestowed on us of His bounty, we will verily, give ṣadaqah (zakāh and voluntary charity in Allāh’s cause) and will be certainly among those who are righteous.’”** ﴿٧٥﴾ Then when He gave them of His Bounty, they became niggardly [refused to pay the ṣadaqah (zakāh or voluntary charity)], and turned away, averse. ﴿٧٦﴾ So, He punished them by putting hypocrisy into their hearts till the Day whereon they shall meet Him, because they broke that (covenant with Allāh) which they had promised Him and because they used to tell lies.” [Sūrah at-Tawbah 9: 75-77]

﴿وَمِنْهُمْ مَّنْ عَاهَدَ اللَّهَ لَئِنْ آتَانَا مِنْ فَضْلِهِ لَنَصَّدَّقَنَّ وَلَنَكُونَنَّ مِنَ الصَّالِحِينَ﴾ ﴿٧٥﴾ فَلَمَّا آتَاهُمْ مِنْ فَضْلِهِ جَحَلُوا بِهِ وَتَوَلَّوْا وَهُمْ مُعْرِضُونَ ﴿٧٦﴾ فَأَعْقَبَهُمْ نِفَاقًا فِي قُلُوبِهِمْ إِلَى يَوْمِ يَلْقَوْنَهُ بِمَا أَخْلَفُوا اللَّهَ مَا وَعَدُوهُ وَبِمَا كَانُوا يَكْذِبُونَ ﴿٧٧﴾ (سورة التوبة)

Likewise, His statement – the Mighty and Sublime: **“And of them are some who accuse you (O Muḥammad) in the matter of (the distribution of) the alms. If they are given part thereof, they are pleased, but if they are not given thereof, behold! They are enraged!”** [Sūrah at-Tawbah 9: 58]

﴿وَمِنْهُمْ مَّنْ يَلْمِزُكَ فِي الصَّدَقَاتِ فَإِنْ أُعْطُوا مِنْهَا رَضُوا وَإِنْ لَمْ يُعْطُوا مِنْهَا إِذَا هُمْ يَسْتَخْطُونَ﴾ ﴿٥٨﴾ (سورة التوبة)

And His words – the Mighty and Sublime: **“Those who defame such of the believers who give charity (in Allāh’s cause) voluntarily, and those who could not find to give charity (in Allāh’s cause) except what is available to them, so**

they mock at them (believers), Allāh will throw back their mockery on them, and they shall have a painful torment.” [Sūrah at-Tawbah 9: 79]

﴿الَّذِينَ يَلْمِزُونَ الْمُطَّوِّعِينَ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ فِي الصَّدَقَاتِ وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَجِدُونَ إِلَّا جُهْدَهُمْ فَيَسْخَرُونَ مِنْهُمْ سَخِرَ اللَّهُ مِنْهُمْ وَلَهُمْ عَذَابٌ أَلِيمٌ﴾ (سورة التوبة)

Sūrah at-Tawbah, which some scholars refer to as the Chapter of Exposure for it exposed the hypocrites, is replete with similar verses.

However, when the revelation came to an end, people no longer identify the hypocrites because hypocrisy resides in the heart, we seek refuge with Allāh.

‘Umar رضي الله عنه said: ‘Whoever displays good to us, we shall take him for that, even if he had concealed evil; but whoever displays evil to us, we shall take him for that even if he hides some good deeds. For we have not been asked to consider except what is apparent.’ this is one of the Bounties of Allāh on us, that we can only be judged by our apparent deeds. Indeed, it is hard to build a judgement on the hidden, and Allāh – the Mighty and Sublime has not burdened a soul beyond its scope.

So, whoever shows good, we will relate with him based on that, and whoever displays evil, we will relate with him based on evil which he has displayed to us. We would not judge his intention; rather, its accountability lies with Allāh, the Lord of the worlds, who knows everything that goes on in the human heart. (2)

→ Commentary by Ḥāfiẓ Ṣalāḥuddīn Yūsuf رحمة الله:

This ḥadīth also proves that the injunctions go with the apparent acts of a person and not with will and intention. It also indicates that a good intention does not waive the qīṣāṣ and establishing the justice. (3)

Takhrīj:

- Mukhtaṣar Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (1195 (2/204))
- Musnad Aḥmad (286 (1/384-385)) [Shu‘ayb al-Arna‘ūt]
- Musnad Aḥmad (286 (1/286-287)) [Aḥmad Shākir]

(2) [395 (3/314-316), Riyāḍuṣ Ṣāliḥīn, Dārussalām (Eng)]

(3) [395 (1/363), Riyāḍuṣ Ṣāliḥīn, Dārussalām (Eng)]

- Musnad al-Fārūq (757-758 (2/429-432))
- Musnad Abī Ya'lā (196 (1/93-94))
- Musnad Shāmīn (3069 (4/185))
- Bayhayqī's Sunan al-Kubrā (16850 (8/349))
- Sharḥ Mushkil al-Āthār (7/84-85)
- Bulūgh al-Marām (1205 (1/497))
- Riyāḍuṣ Ṣāliḥīn (395)
- Khalq Af'āl al-'Ibād (430 (2/223))

